CHAPTER II

REVIEW OF LITERATURE

A literature review as an outline and analysis of related literature that is conducted to provide insights about a study.[1] In corroboration of this view, Johnson and Christensen see a literature review as an explanation of the theoretical underpinnings of the research study related to the current topic[2].

A. Related Studies

In this sub chapter, the writer tries to review some previous studies related to the students' perception on the instructional method applied by the lecturer in teaching reading subject at the english education STAIN palangka raya generally, there are some previous studies discussed the students' perception on the instructional method applied by the lecturers in teaching reading subject however, in this case, the writer only reviewes to three previous studies conducted by students' college of other universities, which had close similarity with the writer study.

They were Alan Victor Brown from university of Arizona. with hisstudy entitled "*students' and teachers' perceptions of effective teaching in the foreign language classsroom: a comparison of ideals and ratings*"[3]

According to his Findings, The concrete manifestation of these perceptions of effective teaching english foreign language in the classroom, is addressed via teaching evaluations. Thus,

---

[1]McMillan & Schumacher, *Research in education: Evidence-Based Inquiry, 6th Edition*, Boston: Pearson, 2006, p. 474

[2]Jonhson & Christensen*, Educational Research: Quantitative, Qualilative, and Mixed Approaches, 2nd Edition*, Boston: Pearson, 2004, p. 62

[3]Alan Victor Brown, *students' and teachers' perceptions of effective teaching in the foreign language classsroom: a comparison of ideals and rating,* university of Arizona:2006, thesis stratum one, university of Arizona, 2006. P 14.

effective classroom management can be established in small-size classes, Furthermore, distinct techniques of assessment can be easily employed in such classes.

Melek Cakmak from Gazy university, Ankara, Turkey. With his Study entitled *"The Perceptions of Student Teachers about the Effects of Class Size With Regard to Effective Teaching Process"*[4] according to his findings, the findings of research project indicates that class size is animportant dimension in planning and realizing effective teaching.

Anupama Bhargava from institute of advanced study in education sambalpur, orissa, india. with his Study entitled *"Perception of Student Teachers about Teaching Competencies"*[5]according to his findings, As per perception of student teachers, basic competencies like honest, patient, kind and caring attitude in a teacher help students to realise their true potential. Students always look forward to encouragement and companionship extended by teachers. Also found that friendly, cheerful, knowledgeable are the characteristics which are always looked up by students in a teacher. Self concept of students becomes high when teacher is more social and willing to extend emotional support to students. advocated this view by stating that a successful teacher is able to develop interpersonal relations with students and stimulate them intellectuality.

Mansoor Ahmed Channa from Mahidol University,Thailand. with his study entitled *"Teachers' Perceptions Towards English Language As Medium Of Instruction In Pakistan"*[6] with his findings, the perceptions towards using english language as medium of instruction in classes. More than half of the participants regarded english language as medium of instructions that determined their success in future in order to meet their global and future needs. However,

---

[4]Melek Cakmak, *The Perceptions of Student Teachers about the Effects of Class Size With Regard to Effective Teaching Process,* Ankara: Gazy University, 2009 (http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR14-3/cakmak.pdf) P.404

[5]Anupama Bhargava, *Perception of Student Teachers about Teaching Competencies,*Orissa: Education sambalpur, 2011(http://American International Journal of Contemporary Research Vol. 1 No.1; July 2011) P 79

[6]Mansoor Ahmed Channa, *Teachers' Perceptions Towards English Language As Medium Of Instruction In Pakistan,*Nakhon Pathom Province:Mahidol University 2011(http://Interdisciplinary Journalof Contemporary Researchin Business,September 2012 vol.4 no 5) P.759

less than half of the participants showed dissatisfying factor that related to the use of english language as mediumof instruction in teaching and learning process in the classroom by encouraging L1 or local language. This study paves a way for future researchers by indicating issues and questions to address.

Based on the related studies above, the similarities between the writer's and researcher's before is about perceptionof some one. There are also some differences between the writer's and researcher's before as follow :

First, Alan Victor Brown, his object study focus on students and teachers perception of effective teaching in the foreign language classroom. Second, Melek Cakmak, his object study focus onthe perceptions of student teachers about the effects of class size with regard to effective teaching process. Thrid, Anupama Bhargava, his object study focus on perception of student teachers about teaching competencies. The last, Mansoor Ahmed Channa, his study focus on teachers' perceptions towards english language as medium of instruction in pakistan.

In this case the writer has different subject and object of the study. The subject is the students of study program of English education of STAIN Palangka Raya, the object of students of reading III perception on academic year 2013/2014. have known and comprehended about the instructional method in teaching.

B. Concept Of Instructional Method

In this section we will discuss about instructional method, learning activities or teaching activities often also referred to as instructional. Of the term "instructional" then the term "instructional purposes".

According to Neumann, S. & Koper R. Instructional Method is defined as a learning outcome oriented set of activitities performed by learners and learning supporters. Example of

instructional methods are the think-pair-share method or the brainstroming.[7] Based on the statement, instructional method is away of presenting (elaborate, give examples, give exercises and assignments) lesson contentfor students to achieve specific instructional goals.

According to Borich, G, Instructional method are used by teachers to create learning and to specify the nature of the activity in which the teacher and learner will be involved during the lesson.[8] While particular methods are often associated with certain strategies, some methods may be found within a variety of strategies.

According to S. L. Wong et al, instructional method is an approach used by educators in course content deliveries.[9] It is aneducational approach for revolving knowledge into learning which focusing on the "how to" in delivery of training. Based on the stetement aboves, Instructional methods are only as good as they contribute to the achievement of a learning objective. In fact, it is often helpful to think of methods as roads which lead to cities(objectives) and of training materials (visuals aids, case study, write-ups, role play, descriptions) as the materials with which the roads are constructed. Participants may need to travel several different high ways in order to reach a given destination. Just as there are differences in training styles, there are also differences in learning styles.

According to H. Douglas Brown, there are 5 methods that can be applied in teaching English skills[10], they are grammar translation method, direct method, audio lingual method, silent way, and teaching physical response, the explanation are as follow :

---

[7]Neumann, S., & Koper, R. *Instructional Method Classifications Lack User Language and Orientation*.Educational Technology & Society, *13* (2) 2010, p.78–89.

[8]Borich, G. *Effective teaching methods.* Colombus:Merill.1998

[9]S. L. Wong et al. Proceedings of the 18th International Conference on Computers in Education. Putrajaya, Malaysia:2010

[10] Brown, H. Douglas. *Teaching by Principles an Interactive Approach to Language Pedagogy*. Second Edition. A Pearson Education Company. 2001

1. The Grammar Translation Method (GTM), This method was born of two methods, namely the Translation Method and the grammar method. Method "Translation" is often also called the "traditional method". This does not mean that it is the oldest method. The term "traditional" may be used in the sense that this method is the most appropriate reflection of language ancient greek and latin taught for many centuries.

Although both languages are no longer so widely used among scientists as the language of instruction (15th century), but still a lot of school/ universities that require student/students learn this language because it is considered to have "higher value education" in reading classical language books, as well as "feel disciplin" trained through logical analysis of language, rules and language rules are complicated sentence patterns as well as the application of principles and rules of practice patterns in the translation.

This method is based on the assumption that there is a "logic of the universe" (universal logic) which is the basis of all the language in this world, and that the grammar is a branch of logic. Categories Indo European grammar categories (represented by Latin) is considered the ideal category category. Many scientists in the 19th century considered that the modern European languages is poor mixing of the classic grammar (traditional) language that is Latin, and that the language other languages in the world (language language outside Europe) as the language of the language still "primitive and undeveloped". Step by step presentation of "Grammar Translation Method" are:

1. Lecturers begin with definitions given kind words, affixes the kind words, rules of rules that must be memorized in language resources, which underscores the examples underscore rules target language, and an exception to the rule in exception target language rules taught that.

2. Lecturers train students in translation sentences and then paragraphs. The material used is selected from the literary language books have a wide snaking the "aesthetic". The student is expected to know the rules of grammar rules that have been memorized, and apply it to the translation. It involves a complex thought about affixes types of speech that has been memorized, to fit the translationre quested by the lecturer.

3. Lecturers provide vocabulary lists to memorize. To said the word sentence out of context, and the teacher told the students to give the translation in language tergets of vocabulary.

4. Lecturers give homework in the form of preparation to explain the pages of the book it is for literature discussed in the next meeting.

5. On methods of Grammar (The Grammar Method), students learn the rules of grammar, together with a list of vocabulary or groups. The words are then used phrases or sentences based on rules that have been studied.

In this method of control rules take precedence over the application. Verbal skills, such as pronunciation, not done. This method of application is easy because the teacher does not have to be fluent to speak the language to be learned, while the evaluation and supervision were not difficult.

Translation method (the Translation Method) contains text translation activities conducted from things easy to difficult. First from the target language into the mother tongue and vice versa. Text translation is done by translating word for word and idea by idea, including idiomatic expressions.

2. **The Direct Method**, This approach was originally developed as a reaction to a "translation grammar" in an effort to better integrate the use of the target language in the teaching and communication in the classroom, with the first language translation techniques to avoid. This method is similar to the method "Gouin Series," namely, that learning a second language should be similar to learning a first language; lots of verbal interaction, and a few rules of grammatical analysis.

Learning the "Direct Method" or the direct method starts with oral dialog and drawings, the mother tongue is not used and no translation. Preferred type of exercise is a series of questions in the target language based on funny dialogue or "anecdotal narrative." Questions will be answered in the target language. Learning process with the "Direct Method", the teacher asks the students to read aloud, and the teacher gave questions in the language being studied. During the learning process, the reality of such maps or objects that can actually be used. Teachers can draw or demonstrate. The techniques in the Direct Method namely:

a. Reading aloud

b. Question and answer exercise

c. Getting students to self-correct

d. Conversation practice

e. Fill-in-the-blanks

f. Dictation

g. Map drawing

h. Paragraph writing

3. **The Audio Lingual Method,** This method is based on the principles of behavioral psychology. This method is adapted from the procedure "Direct Method" as a reaction to the lack of language skills. The new material is presented in the form of dialogue. Based on the principle that language learning is a form of habit and imitation. Learning Path with "Method Audio lingual," gradually using repetitive pattern or practice "repetitive drills," a little explanation of grammar (the grammar is taught inductively).

The term audio-lingualisme first put forward by Prof. Nelson Brooks in this method is claimed as the most effective and efficient in learning a foreign language and expressed as a teaching method that has changed the language of only a language of scientific method. Audio-lingual method (ALM) is the result of a combination of views and principles of structural linguistics, contrastive Analysis, Aural-Oral approach, and behavioristic psychology. ALM rationale of the language, teaching, and learning a language is as follows:

a.   Language is spoken, not written

b.   Language is a set of habits

c.   Teach the language and not about language

d.   Language is as spoken by native speakers

e.   Language that other one with a different

Conversation serves as a tool to put the key structures on the context and provide illustrations of situations where such structures are used by native speakers, so as well as the implementation of the cultural aspects of the target language. Repetition and memorization became the dominant activity in this method. Certain grammatical patterns in conversations selected to be a pattern of practice activities. Learning activities based ALM are: repetition,

inflection, relplacement, restatement, completion, transposition, expansion, contraction, transformation, integration, rejoinders, and restoration.

4. **Silent Way,** In the learning process, the teacher just pointed to a chart that contains the vocal consonant. Teachers pointed several times to be quiet. After a while the teacher just gave an example of the pronunciation. Then appoint students to recite to correct. Teachers in the learning process a lot of silence, he only directed / pointed in the learning material. The techniques Silent Way:

a. Sound-Color Chart

b. Teacher's Silence

c. Peer Correction

d. Rods

e. Self-Correction Gestures

f. Word chart feedback

g. Fidel chart

h. Structured feedback

5. **Total Phisycal Response,** This method is also called 'the comprehension approach' which touches on the importance of 'listening comprehension'. In the early stages of learning a foreign language focused on listening comprehension. It is based on the observation of how children learn their mother tongue. A baby listening around him for months before he can be called a word.

Students listen to teachers who communicate with foreign language learning process starts early. Teachers can help students to understand the material by using a picture and a few words in the native language. Natural Approach is similar to Direct Method. In the Total Physical Response (TPR), students listen and respond to oral instructions of teachers. Form of instruction given as 'Turn around', 'Sit down', 'Walk', 'Stop', and 'Jump'. Techniques in the Total Physical Response Method, namely:

a. Using Commands to Direct Method

b. Role Reversal

c. Action sequence

According to Cruikshank, Bainer & Metcalf, here are 12 varieties of teaching methods they are as follows[11] :

1. **Activity**, a general teaching method (e.g., problem solving, design challenge, field trips, role playing) based on planned, purposeful involvement of students.

2. **Brainstorming**, order to generate creative ideas, learners are asked to with hold judgment or criticism and produce a very large number of ways to do something, such as resolve a problem. For example, learners may be asked to think of as many they can for eliminating world hunger. Once a large number of ideas have been generated, they are subjected to inspection regarding their feasibility.

3. **Case study**, A detailed analysis is made of some specific, usually compelling event or series of related events so that learners will better understand its nature and what might be done about it. For example, learners in a technology lab might investigate the wear and tear of skate

---

[11] Cruikshank, Bainer & Metcalf, *Teaching Method; Lesson planning,* McGraw-Hill Boston:1999

boarding on public works. Another class might look at cases of digital technologies and privacy.

4. **Cooperative learning**, Learners are placed in groups of four to six. Sometimes the groups are as diverse or heterogeneous as possible. In such cases, group members are often rewarded for the group's overall success. Student groups might be given a teacher presentation on division of fractions. They would then be given worksheets to complete.

5. **Debate**, a form of discussion where by a few students present and contest varying points of view with regard to an issue. For example, students could take different positions and debate an issue: "Should rights to free speech on the internet be extended to students in schools?"

6. **Demonstration**, a teaching method based predominantly on the modeling of knowledge and skills. A form of presentation whereby the teacher or learners show how something works or operates, or how something is done. For example, a teacher could demonstrate how to use a thesaurus, how to operate a power drill, how to scan an image, or what happens when oil is spilled on water as when an oil tanker leaks.

7. **Direct instruction**, a term used to describe explicit, step-by-step instruction directed by the teacher. The format or regimen advocated is demonstration, guided practice, and independent practice. Thus the teacher might teach a reading, mathematics, geography or technology concept or skill. Following that, students practice under teacher supervision. Finally, independent practice is done to the point of mastery.

8. **Discussion**, Discussions occur when a group assembles to communicate with one another through speaking and listening about a topic or event of mutual interest.

9. **Field observation**, fieldwork, field trip**-** Observations made or work carried on in anatural setting. Students visit the local museum of natural history to see displays about dinosaurs, or they begin and operate a small business to learn about production and marketing.

10. **Presentation and lecture**, Students listen to a person who talks about a topic. To illustrate, the teacher, or a guest speaker, tells the class all about the invention of the transistor.

11. **Project**, Students work through a series of activities and problems culminating in the completion of something tangible (e.g., artifact, media, performance). A form of individualization whereby learners choose and work on projects and activities that facilitate and support the development of skills and knowledge.

12. **Role playing**, Learners take on the role of another person or character to see what it would be like to be that person or character. Thus, a student could play the role of an imaginary student no one likes or a news reporter.

In view of the alerady recognized were correct to say, that every method has the properties of each well be easier to establish the best method for matching special circumstances faced, if the teacher understand the nature of each of these method. Generally we have met on instructional patterns where lecturers in general have a position as the only source of learning in the instructional system. Lecturer in controling and completing control of putting the content and method of learning, sometimes also in assesing the progress of student learning.

C. The Instructional Method In Teaching Reading

According to Snow, Burns, and Griffin contend that, Reading is a complex developmental challenge that we know to be intertwined with many other developmental accomplishments: attention, memory, language, and motivation, for example. Reading is not only a cognitive psycholinguistic activity but also a social activity.[12]

According to Aziz, Reading is away to develop thinking and behavior and the low reading culture becomes national issue, reading should be done in easier way and in comfortable environment.[13] As a result, the term reading is currently interpreted far more broadly and encompasses the learning of a complex set of skills and knowledge that allows individuals to understand visual and print-based information.

Reading is about understanding written texts. It is complex activity that involves both perception and thought, Reading consist of two related processes : word recognition and comprehension. Word recognition refers to the process of perceiving how written symbols correspond to one spoken language, meanwhile, comprehension is the process of making sense of words, sentences and connected texts. Readers typically make use of their background knowledge, vocabulary, grammatical knowledge, experience with the text and others strategies to help them understand the written texts. Besides, when comprehension breaks down, especially in foreign or second language, the students need to improve their comprehension.[14] This is a condition where the importance of instructional method in teaching reading comes in so as to facilitate the reading process and give the students a clear sense of what they are reading.

---

[12]Snow, C. E., Burns, M. S., & Griffin, P. *Preventing reading failure I young children.* Washington, DC: National Academy Press: 1998

[13] Aziz SA, *The need to read.* The Jakarta post, January 1999

[14] Budi C & Nur Mukminatien, *Technique and Strategies to Enchance English Language Learning*, state university Malang press: Malang, 2011

However, when reading strategies are not readily available, the students become easily frustrated and bored because they do not understand what they are reading and as a result, the students have no motivation to read any longer. Bridging the gap between students learning styles and teacher's teaching styles will be powerful means to guide students toward successful learning. The strategies used would help the students to comprehend the texts easily and to improve the students reading skills. Reading strategies have always been important in teaching and learning strategies studies.[15]

According to Nunan, to accomplish the importance of applying teaching strategy, are the mental and communicative procedures which learners use in order to learn and to use language.[16] Based on the states, the use of the strategy would make the students to be critical thinkers also to be lifelong learners with better communicative during lesson. Grabe states, considers reading as an active process of comprehending and he states that students need to be taught strategies to read more efficiency (example. Guessing meaning from context, defining expectation, making inferences about the text, and skimming ahead to fill in the context).[17]

According to Mason & Au, pre-reading activities are instructional activities carried out before students conduct the real reading activities, in pre-reading activities, activations is concerned with students background knowledge, objectives of reading class, learning activities, and motivating the students.[18] In this stage, teacher try to active students' schemata related to the topic of the text, by presenting key words, asking questions related the topic, explaining briefly the contents of the text. The activation of students' schemata is aimed at making it easier for the students to comprehend the text to be read.

---

[15] Ibid pages 75-76
[16] Nunan D, *Secound Language Teaching and Learning,* Boston, MA: Hainle, 1999.
[17] Grabe W, *Current Development in Second Language Reading Reaserch*, Tesol:quarterly, 1991
[18] Mason, J.M, & Au,K.H. *Reading Instruction for today .second edition*. New York:Harper Collins Publhiser.1990.

According to Ken Lackman & Associates, whilst activities are strategies, that, are employed as the reader is actually reading through the text. They are a bit more problematic to implement with students as it is hard to monitor what a learner is actually doing while reading (reading out loud is not considered valid reading practice) and there is sometimes a danger that the use of a strategy will interrupt or hinder the relatively natural flow of reading that is often so hard for learners to achieve. For example, studies have shown that the most effective readers are those who learn to gloss over words whose meaning they are not sure of and continue on reading through the text. Learners often fall into the trap of "tunneling" where they get overly concerned about the meaning of one word and in trying to decipher it lose some comprehension of what they have already read. So, the trick to implementing these strategies is to try not to hinder optimum reading speed and also not to take the learner's focus off comprehension of the text as a whole. What has been shown through studies is that strategies that get the students to interact with the text greatly improve comprehension. For example, texts with questions to the reader, even if rhetorical, seem to be understood by readers more than texts without them.[19]

According to Tierney & Cunningham, post-reading activities are the conducted by a reader after reading. The activities are used to recheck readers understanding on the text topic being read. In post-reading activities, students do post-questions, feedback, and group and whole class discussions. Post-reading activities are instructional activities that the students and teacher do after reading takes place. [20] point out that post-questions, feedback, and group and whole-class discussion are activities that can be done in the phase of post-reading activities. The activities function to check students' comprehension about the text being read.

---

[19] Ken Lackman, *methods and activities for more effective teaching with les, --------------s*http://www.kenlackman.com (online on May 06, 2014)

[20] Tierny, R.J, & Cunningham, J.W. *Research on teaching reading comprehension. In R. C. Pearson, A Handbook of reading research.* London: Logman. 1984

According to Mealey & Nist, the post-questions after reading class activity are very important since information of both greater and lesser important is learned. Beside asking questions, summarizing the contents of the text is also applicable to the students, encouraging students to involve more actively with the text. The result of summary can be used as the basis of determining the students' level of understanding to the text.[21] The activity of post-reading can also be in the forms discussion. Students are asked to discuss the writer ideas. This discussion can be in a group or whole-class discussion. The discussion may depend on the class size, if the class is big, it will be better to have group discussion. If the class is small, it will be better to have whole class discussion.

D. Concept Of Perceptions

Definition of perception According to Nelson and Quick, perception is the process of interpreting information about another person.[22] What this definition has clearly highlighted for our attention is that the opinions us form about another person depends on the amount of information available to us and the extent to which us able to correctly interpret the information we have acquired. In another people have on a particular ituation, the capacity to interpret the information that we all have.

According to Joseph, R.A.H.R. Markus, & R. W. Tafarodi, Perception is how you look at others and the world arround you.[23] Because your total awarness of the world comes through your senses, they all have a common basis and a common bias. How you look at the world

[21] Mealey, D.L. & Nist,S.L. *Post-Secondary Teacher Directed Comprehension Strategies.* Journal of Reading. 1986.

[22] Quick, D.L. and Nelson, J.C, *Organisational Behavior: Foundations, Realities, and Challenges*, (New York: West Publishing Company),1997 pp. 83-84.

[23] Joseph, R. A., H. R. Markus, & R. W. Tafarodi. Gender and self-esteem. *Journal ofPersonality and Social Psychology* 63:3, 1992.p 391–402.

depends on what you think of your self, andd what you yhink of your self will influence how you look at the world.

Perception may be defined from physical, and physiological perspectives. But for the purpose of this study, it shall be limited to its scope as postulated by Allport, which is the way we judge or evaluate others. that is the way individuals evaluate people with whom they are familiar in everyday life.[24] Eggen and Kauchak gave cognitive dimension of perception; they see perception as the process by which people attach meaning to experiences. they explained that after people attend to certain stimuli in their sensory memories, processing continues with perception. perception is critical because it influences the information that enters working memory. Background knowledge in the form of schemas affects perception and subsequent learning. Research findings have corroborated this claim that background knowledge resulting from experience strongly influence perception.

Baron and Byrne called it "social perception" which is the process through which we attempt to understand other persons. Attempt to obtain information about the temporary causes of others' behavior (for example, the emotions or feelings).[25] The term "apperception" can also be used for the term under study. Apperception is an extremely useful word in pedagogic, and offers a convenient name for aprocess to which every teacher must frequently refer. It means the act of taking a thing into the mind.

The relatedness of this view of perception to the present study is further explained, that every impression that comes infrom without, be it a sentence, which we hear, an objector vision, no sooner enters our consciousness than it is drafted off in some determinate directions or others, making connection with other materials already there and finally producing what we call our

---

[24]Eggen P, Kauchak D, Educational psychology: Windows on classrooms. New Jersey Prentice Hall, Inc 2001.

[25]Baron RA, Byrne D.*Social psychology (8th ed.).* Boston,:Allynand Bacon.1991

reaction. From this it is clear that perception is the reaction elicited when an impression is perceived from without after making connection with other materials in the consciousness (memory). From this point of view two implications could be deduced. Firstly, perception cannot be done in vacuum, it depend on some background information that will triggera reaction.

This is consistent with the view of researchers[26] and the overall research problem of this study. Students' perception of teachers' knowledge of subject matter, attitudes to work and teaching skills is absolutely dependent on the fact that they have been taught by the teachers under evaluation and are familiar with them. They therefore, have minds already pre-occupied with memories and reactions that inventory for data collection will measure. Secondly, studies had confirmed possible influences on apperception.

Perception may be energized by both the present and past experience, individual attitude at a particular moment, the physical state of the sense organ, the interestof the person, the level of attention, and the interpretation given to the perception.

E. Frame of Thinking

The frame of thinking that presented by the writer as the basic of data are obtained in the field. Therefore, by this study the writer wants to know about the students perceptions on the instructional method applied by the lecturers in teaching reading at the English study program of STAIN Palangka Raya as follows:

---

[26]Allport GW. *Pattern and growth in personality*. London: William Clowes and Sons, Ltd.

```
┌─────────────────────────────────────────────────────────────┐
│              The Students' Perceptions on the                │
│                                                               │
│   Instructional Method Applied by the Lecturer in Teaching Reading │
└─────────────────────────────────────────────────────────────┘
         │                      │                       │
         ▼                      ▼                       ▼
┌──────────────┐      ┌──────────────┐      ┌──────────────────┐
│  Observation │      │  Interviews  │      │  Documentation   │
└──────────────┘      └──────────────┘      └──────────────────┘
         │                      │                       │
         ▼                      ▼                       ▼
┌─────────────────────────────────────────────────────────────┐
│                       Analysis the Data                       │
└─────────────────────────────────────────────────────────────┘
                              │
                              ▼
                    ┌──────────────────┐
                    │    Discussion    │
                    └──────────────────┘
                              │
                              ▼
                    ┌──────────────────┐
                    │    Conclusion    │
                    └──────────────────┘
```